REPORTS

Expert Meeting on Communication, 9-10 February 2016, Oslo, Norway

(Submitted by the Acting Secretary of the IPCC)
Introduction

At its 41st Session, the Panel requested an expert meeting in which participants would share experiences, best practices and lessons learned from communication and outreach around the Fifth Assessment Report, and on which a report would be prepared for the 43rd Session of the Panel.

The meeting was held in Oslo, Norway, on 9 and 10 February 2016 with the generous support of the Norwegian Environment Agency. The preparatory Steering Committee prepared the programme and agenda for the Expert Meeting, recommended a list of participants to the Chair of the IPCC, and will prepare the substantive report of the Expert Meeting.

The Steering Committee is overseeing the production of a Report of the Expert Meeting, with the draft circulated to all meeting participants for review and concurrence, which will be published on the IPCC website.

Meeting Summary

The mandate of the Expert Meeting was to consider lessons learned from communication and outreach around the Fifth Assessment Report (AR5) and to provide recommendations to the Panel as it started work on the Sixth Assessment Report (AR6).

A preparatory Steering Committee was constituted and submitted nominations of participants to the Chair of the IPCC, taking into account the relevant range of expertise, geographical representation and gender balance.

The Expert Meeting held a number of discussions, facilitated by papers and presentations, on the particular constraints affecting IPCC communications; the experience of the Co-Chairs and authors in developing the AR5 from a communication perspective; the experience of governments (including IPCC Focal Points) and civil society in organizing outreach on the AR5; research on media coverage of the AR5 in major markets; the experience of other organizations communicating climate assessments; and recent research on communications relating to climate change.

The Expert Meeting divided into break-out groups on both days which worked on draft recommendations. These groups covered questions of readability and clarity; derivative products; communications with different stakeholders and outreach; communications with media. They also considered recommendations for updating the IPCC Communications Strategy.

The Expert Meeting also held a discussion with the Children’s Panel on Climate Change, a Norwegian-based non-governmental organization, on communicating climate change to young people.

The proceedings of the plenary sessions were streamed live to promote transparency. Comments on social media about the Expert Meeting (with the hashtag #IPCCOslo) were reported back to the plenary on both days.

Main Meeting Recommendations

The Expert Meeting drew up a large number of recommendations to improve IPCC communications. The final list will be included in the substantive report after review by the Steering Committee and participants.
They included recommendations on the following topics:

**Improving readability, clarity and policy relevance**
- Involvement of stakeholders in the scoping process.
- Involvement of communications experts from the outset of the report process.
- The focus and length of the Summary for Policymakers (SPM).
- The structure of the report, including expert summaries and Frequently Asked Questions (FAQs).
- The naming of Working Groups and Working Group contributions.
- Presentation of material that is new to the report versus the previous body of knowledge.
- Treatment of uncertainty.
- Learning from the experience of other organizations conducting assessments.
- Media training and presentation training for authors.
- The role of graphics specialists and data visualists.
- Testing graphics and developing simpler graphics for the SPM.
- Hold an expert meeting on the science of communication of (climate) science.

**Derivative products (IPCC and third parties)**
- Defining what the IPCC can do and what is best left to third parties.
- Providing technical and other support for third-party derivative products.
- Prepare likely key messages early on.
- Use of animation as well as video.
- Encourage the use of FAQs to support reports.
- Linking to derivative products on the IPCC website.

**Communication with stakeholders and outreach**
- Communicating the scoping process.
- Involving observer organizations and others in finding experts to represent stakeholders in the scoping process.
- Meeting stakeholders to seek their input in the pre-scoping process.
- Consider the ambitious use of tagging to enable users to customize their own versions of the report.
- Strengthening communication with the United Nations Framework Convention on Climate Change (UNFCCC).
- Engaging third parties to communicate elements of the report to specific audiences.
- Considering opening the Trust Fund to voluntary contributions from stakeholders.
- Organizing local and regional events that reflect local priorities and encourage participation of authors from the region.
- Working with focal points and other partners to involve participation of all relevant stakeholders and sectors in outreach activities.
- Preparing clear generic presentations that can be customized.
- Reviewing social media practice, including use of short videos in multiple languages and use of different platforms in different regions.
- Working with children, including helping them with videos.
- Considering two website entry points – one user-friendly, one for reference (cf UNFCCC).

**Communication with and through media**
- Incorporating science writers and media experts in working groups.
- Briefing media before the release of a report.
- Preparation to ensure communication is global and reaches non-English speakers.
- Long-term planning to anticipate a changing media landscape while recognizing continuing role of radio and mobile.
- Use of professionally produced multimedia including animations, graphics and videos.
- Creating a communications network.
- Starting to prepare communication of a report at an early stage in its development.
- Planning the timing of press conferences to fit media schedules and allowing time for rest and rehearsal.
- Considering regional as well as global launches of reports.
- Strengthen the use of media workshops and other media training.
- Holding meetings with editorial boards.
- Explaining the IPCC’s transparency policies.
- Reviewing confidentiality of drafts.

**IPCC Communications Strategy**

- Many of the above have implications for the Communications Strategy, especially its sections on Methods and Tools, or its Implementation Plan.

**Annexes**

Annex 1 includes the scoping paper for the Expert Meeting
Annex 2 includes the programme of the Expert Meeting
Annex 3 includes the list of participants in the Expert Meeting
Background Information

At the 41st Session of the IPCC (IPCC-41) (Nairobi, Kenya, 24-27 February 2015), the Panel decided to organize a meeting with the mandate to share experiences, best practices and lessons learned from communication and outreach around the Fifth Assessment Report, and prepare a report for the 43rd Session. It agreed to include 20 journeys for this meeting in the forecast budget for 2016. The Norwegian Environment Agency (Miljødirektoratet) generously offered to host the meeting in Oslo.

The Acting Chair of the IPCC formed a Steering Committee consisting of the former IPCC Communications Action Team (CAT) and external representatives. Its members are:

Former CAT:
- Mr Ismail El Gizouli (former IPCC Acting Chair)
- Mr Jean-Pascal van Ypersele (former IPCC Vice-Chair)
- Ms Melinda Tignor (former Director of Operations, IPCC Working Group I TSU)
- Ms Katie Mach (former Science Director, IPCC Working Group II TSU)
- Mr Patrick Eickemeier (former Head of Communications, IPCC Working Group III TSU)*
- Mr Taka Hiraishi (former Co-Chair, Task Force on National Greenhouse Gas Inventories)*
- Mr Kiyoto Tanabe (Co-Chair, Task Force on National Greenhouse Gas Inventories)**
- Mr Leo Meyer (former Head, IPCC Synthesis Report TSU)
- Mr Bruce Stewart (Acting Secretary, IPCC Secretariat)***
- Mr Jonathan Lynn (Head of Communications, IPCC Secretariat)

---------
* until October 2015
** from October 2015
*** until December 2015

External members:
- Mr Øyvind Christophersen (Norwegian focal point for the IPCC)
- Mr Rabelani Tshikalanke (South Africa Department of Environmental Affairs)
- Mr Enrique Maurtua Konstantinidis (Fundación Ambiente y Recursos Naturales)
- Ms Susan Joy Hassol (Climate Communication)
- Ms Monica Araya (Nivela)

Observers:
- Mr Carlos Martin-Novella (Deputy Secretary, IPCC)
- Mr Espen Larsen (Norwegian Environment Agency)

The Steering Committee met once in person (in Paris, during COP21) on 10 December 2015 and 10 times by conference call (21 August 2015, 1 September 2015, 16 October 2015, 27 October 2015, 19 November 2015, 5 January 2016, 12 January 2016, 20 January 2016, 27 January 2016, and 2 February 2016). The focus of these calls was agreeing the dates of the meeting, finalizing the list to be submitted to the Chair of the IPCC of participants to be invited, and finalizing the goals and agenda of the meeting.

The Expert Meeting was held on 9-10 February 2016 in Oslo. A total of 72 participants attended the meeting, including 49 invited experts, of whom 19 from developing countries/economies in transition had their travel supported by the IPCC. The other participants were 10 from the preparatory Steering Committee (of whom 3 had their travel supported by the IPCC Trust Fund), 8 from the current IPCC Executive Committee and 5 from the Secretariat.

About half of the meeting was devoted to presentations and about half to discussions in break-out groups on recommendations.
The costs of the meeting for the IPCC totaled CHF 77,034, consisting of travel support for invited experts, members of the Steering Committee, members of the current Executive Committee and Secretariat staff.

19 invited experts (developing countries/economies in transition)  
CHF 51,611

3 members of the Steering Committee (developing countries/economies in transition)  
CHF  8,321

3 eligible members of the Executive Committee  
CHF  7,807

5 secretariat staff  
CHF  9,248

Miscellaneous  
CHF  47

In addition, the Norwegian Environment Agency hosted the meeting, and participants received support from governments and institutions, including the United Nations Framework Convention on Climate Change Secretariat, World Meteorological Organization, governments of Belgium, France, Germany, New Zealand, Norway, Switzerland, United Kingdom and United States, Cambridge Institute for Sustainability Leadership, Carbon Brief, Climate Outreach, European Climate Foundation, Finnish Meteorological Institute, Fordham University, Institute for Global Environmental Strategies, Quaker United Nations Office, Reuters Institute for the Study of Journalism, The B-Team, University of East Anglia, University of Queensland Global Change Institute, World Energy Council, Yale Program in Climate Change Communication, and Yale University.

The presentations covered general questions of communication, the particular constraints facing the IPCC in communications, the experience of communicating AR5 from the perspective of the authors and previous co-chairs, the experience of AR5 outreach from the perspective of governments, other policymakers and civil society organizations, how AR5 was reported by the media, and how other organizations communicate their climate assessments. The break-out groups examined readability, clarity, policy relevance – including the scoping process, use of communications experts, and use of multimedia; derivative products; outreach and communications with different stakeholders; and communicating through the media.
Programme

Tuesday 9 February
(08.00-09.00 registration)

1. **09.00-09.15** Formal opening
   Audun Rosland, director of the climate department, Norwegian Environment Agency
   Hoesung Lee, IPCC Chair *(via videoconference)*
   Chair: Christian Bjørnæs

2. **09.15-09.45** IPCC communication issues – constraints and opportunities
   Chair: Christian Bjørnæs
   Presenter: Jonathan Lynn
   Advance paper
   Advance paper on *preparations for the release of AR5 and previous reports*
   Current IPCC Communications Strategy
   IPCC Communications Strategy *Implementation Note*
   AR5 Communications Strategy

3. **09.45-10.30** The AR5 experience – communications lessons from the authors
   Panel discussion with co-chairs and authors from AR5 who describe what worked and what did not in developing the report from a readability and access perspective, identifying key challenges and areas for improvement
   Panelists will be requested to submit brief advance papers, and highlight key points in opening statements of ~5 minutes to initiate the discussion
   Chair: Christian Bjørnæs
   Panelists: *Chris Field, Leo Meyer, Pauline Midgley, Youba Sokona*
   Advance papers

4. **10.30-11.15** The AR5 experience – lessons from outreach
   Panel discussion with representatives of governments and NGOs on AR5 outreach in developed and developing countries
   Panelists will be requested to submit brief advance papers, and highlight key points in brief opening statements of ~2-3 minutes to initiate the discussion
   Chair: Christian Bjørnæs
   Panelists: *Oyvind Christophersen, Hunter Cutting, Jessica Dator-Bercilla, Christiane Textor, Rabelani Tshikalanke, Simbisai Zhanje*
   Advance papers

5. **11.15-12.15** World Café (with coffee)
   The context for this discussion is that AR6 will probably appear in 2021/2022. How will we communicate its findings to the teenagers and young people (currently children) who will face the consequences of climate change that AR6 will describe? Already young people today tend not to get their information from conventional media such as newspapers and TV, or from books.
The questions will be:

- How can the IPCC communicate its often dense and technical material not only to policymakers but the wider world, bearing in mind that communications methods are changing fast?
- What new stakeholder groups can the IPCC reach and how?
- What new communications products can the IPCC use (including new types of derivative products, or new types of outreach activity)?

Hosts: Monica Araya, Øyvind Christoffersen, Enrique Maurtua Konstantinidis, Katie Mach, Asher Minns, Rabelani Tshikalanke, Michael Williams, Mandy Woods, Jean-Pascal van Ypersele

Participants will be allocated to one of nine groups, which will each move between three tables for three sessions of 15 minutes each.

6. 12.15-12.45 The JPI Study on Communicating AR5
   Chair: Monica Araya
   Presenter: James Painter
   Respondent: Laura Gallardo
   (Panelists from previous sessions encouraged to comment)
   Advance paper on JPI study
   Advance paper: compilation of recent relevant research and publications

7. 12.45-13.30 Climate communications – other assessments
   This will also touch on questions such as training scientists in presentations for non-specialists, and use of photos
   Chair: Monica Araya
   Presenter: Susan Joy Hassol
   Advance paper

8. 13.30-14.30 Lunch

9. 14.30-17.15 Break-out sessions to develop recommendations for the Panel (coffee available 16.00):

   NB 1: Recommendations should also address specific issues in developing countries.

   NB 2 Recommendations should consider any resource implications, and should also consider the communications role of National Focal Points and Technical Support Units.

   NB 3: Participants are encouraged to move between groups. If moving between groups, it is recommended to do so at 16.00 on Tuesday and at 11.15 or after lunch on Wednesday.

   NB 4: Co-Chairs and rapporteurs will also develop recommendations for updating the IPCC Communications Strategy (and Implementation Plan), with help from participants dedicated to this task. (Pauline Midgley, Rapporteurs for the Communications Strategy for each break-out group).

   i. 14.30-15.00 Reports back from World Café by hosts; briefing on role of break-out sessions and participation in different break-out groups
      Chair: Christian Bjørnæs

   ii. 15.00-17.15 Break-out sessions
A. Recommendations on improving readability, clarity and policy relevance of the IPCC reports (including scoping; use of language experts, science writers, graphics designers; summary for citizens of the world; translation; training on presentations; use of video, animations and graphics)
   Co-Chairs: Richard Black, Debra Roberts
   Rapporteur: John Cook
   Rapporteur for Communications Strategy: Christiane Textor
   Participants to include: David Budescu
   Advance papers

B. Recommendations on derivative products (including any formal or informal role for the IPCC; development of presentations for non-specialists)
   Co-Chairs: Leo Meyer, Simbisai Zhanje
   Rapporteur: Joyashree Roy
   Rapporteur for Communications Strategy: Youba Sokona
   Participants to include: Eliot Whittington
   Advance papers

C. Recommendations on communications with stakeholders (including scoping, outreach and social media; stakeholders include children; presentations for non-specialists)
   Co-Chairs: Rabelani Tshikalanke, Jean-Pascal van Ypersele
   Rapporteur: Jessica Dator-Bercilla
   Rapporteur for Communications Strategy: Eduardo Calvo
   Participants to include: Andreas Fischlin; Paul Lussier
   Advance papers

D. Recommendations on communications with and through media (including communications before a report is finalized, use of external resources, the launch process, media training, transparency of IPCC meetings and activities)
   Co-Chairs: Tim Nuthall, Monica Araya
   Rapporteur: Heidi Cullen
   Rapporteur for Communications Strategy: Ko Barrett
   Participants to include: Lance Ignon, Jill Peeters
   Advance papers

10. 17.30-18.15 Reports of Day 1 break-out sessions and follow-up discussion
    To include some written material or slides
    Chair: Christian Bjørnæs

11. 18.15-18.30 Compilation of Day 1 Twitter comments (#IPCCOslo)
    Presenter: Nina Peeva

12. 19.00-21.30 Visit to Ski Museum and Holmenkollen ski jump tower with dinner, followed by guided tour in groups and talk about importance of snow to countries like Norway and challenges posed by climate change
    Buses will leave the meeting venue at 18.30 and go directly to the museum/ski jump (not via hotels). Transport will be arranged back to the hotels afterwards.
Wednesday 10 February

13. **08.00-09.00** Meeting of break-out group co-chairs and rapporteurs to discuss recommendations for communications strategy

14. **09.00-09.15** Recap of previous day, discussion of cross-cutting issues including social media, training authors, products not approved by the Panel, involvement in third-party products.
   Chair: Christian Bjørnæs

15. **09.15-09.45** Tackling misinformation and misconceptions
   Chair: Christian Bjørnæs
   Presenter: John Cook
   Advance paper

16. **09.45-10.30** Beyond the transmission belt – “upstream” communications and stakeholder values
   Chair: Christian Bjørnæs
   Presenter: Paul Lussier
   Respondent: Beth Holland
   Advance papers

16. **10.30-12.15** Break-out sessions (as above) (coffee available at 11.00)

17. **12.15-13.45** Lunch
   Side event – Children’s Panel on Climate Change (Barnas Klimapanelet)
   - Presentation by Children’s Panel on Climate Change
   - Discussion on communicating climate change to young people


19. **15.15-16.00** Break for rapporteurs to prepare reports

20. **16.00-16.45** Reports of break-out sessions, follow-up discussion (coffee available at 16.00)
   Chair: Christian Bjørnæs
   Rapporteurs: Christine Textor, Joyashree Roy, Jessica Dator-Bercilla, Heidi Cullen, Pauline Midgley

21. **16.45-17.00** Compilation of Day 2 Twitter comments (#IPCCOslo)
    Presenter: Nina Peeva

22. **17.00-17.15** Conclusions and explanation of next steps
    Presenter: Jonathan Lynn
List of Participants

Imelda ALBAÑO
Philippines EnviroNews
PHILIPPINES

Mercedes ANDRADE
National Autonomous University of Mexico
MEXICO

Claudio ANGELO
Observatório do Clima
BRAZIL

Monica ARAYA
Nivela
COSTA RICA

Yunwen BAI
Greenovation Hub
CHINA

Jesbin BAIDYA
IPCC Secretariat

Hoda BARAKA
350.org
EGYPT

Ko BARRET
IPCC Vice-Chair
National Oceanic and Atmospheric Administration
UNITED STATES OF AMERICA

Christian BJØRNÆS
Centre for International Climate and Environment (CICERO)
NORWAY

Richard BLACK
Energy and Climate Intelligence Unit
UNITED KINGDOM

Gabriel BLANCO
Universidad Nacional del Centro de la Provincia de Buenos Aires
ARGENTINA

David BUDESCU
Fordham University
UNITED STATES OF AMERICA

Eduardo CALVO
Co-Chair: IPCC Task Force on National Greenhouse Gas Inventories
Universidad Nacional Mayor de San Marcos
PERU

Øyvind CHRISTOPHERSEN
Norwegian focal point for the IPCC
Norwegian Environment Agency
NORWAY

Maite CIGARAN
Libélula
PERU

John COOK
University of Queensland
AUSTRALIA

Lindsey Fielder COOK
Quaker United Nations Office
GERMANY

Adam CORNER
Climate Outreach
UNITED KINGDOM

Heidi CULLEN
Climate Central
UNITED STATES OF AMERICA

Hunter CUTTING
Climate Nexus
UNITED STATES OF AMERICA

Jessica DATOR-BERCILLA
Christian Aid
PHILIPPINES

Suraje DESSAI
University of Leeds
UNITED KINGDOM

Ahmed DJOGHLAF
Co-Chair: Ad-hoc group on the Durban Platform, United Nations Framework Convention on Climate Change
ALGERIA

Surveyor EFIK
Climate Change Network Nigeria
NIGERIA
Argelia FERNÁNDEZ
Environment Cuba
CUBA

Chris FIELD
Former Co-Chair: IPCC Working Group II
Carnegie Department of Global Ecology
UNITED STATES OF AMERICA

Andreas FISCHLIN
Vice-Chair: IPCC Working Group II
ETH Zurich
SWITZERLAND

Jan FUGLESTVEDT
Vice-Chair: IPCC Working Group I
CICERO - Centre for International Climate
and Environmental Research - Oslo
NORWAY

Laura GALLARDO
Universidad de Chile
CHILE

Evelyne GBE DEBA
United Nations Environmental, Scientific and
Cultural Organisation
COTE D’IVOIRE

David HANSFORD
Writer, Editor, Blogger and Photographer
NEW ZEALAND

Susan Joy HASSOL
Climate Communication
UNITED STATES OF AMERICA

Beth HOLLAND
Pacific Centre for Environment and
Sustainable Development
FIJI

Lance IGNON
IPCC Secretariat

Enrique Maurtua KONSTANTINIDIS
Fundación Ambiente y Recursos Naturales
ARGENTINA

Nina KUKKURAINEN
Finnish Meteorological Institute
FINLAND

Espen LARSEN
Norwegian Environment Agency
NORWAY

Hoesung LEE
IPCC Chair
University of Korea
REPUBLIC OF KOREA

Anthony LEISEROWITZ
Yale Programme on Climate Change
Communication
UNITED STATES OF AMERICA

Paul LUSSIER
Yale University
UNITED STATES OF AMERICA

Jonathan LYNN
IPCC Secretariat

Katie MACH
Former Head of Science: IPCC Working
Group II
Carnegie Department of Global Ecology
UNITED STATES OF AMERICA

Valérie MASSON-DELMOTE
Co-Chair: IPCC Working Group I
University of Paris-Saclay
FRANCE

Leo MEYER
Former Head: Technical Support Unit, IPCC
AR5 Synthesis Report
THE NETHERLANDS

Pauline MIDGLEY
Former Head: Technical Support Unit, IPCC
Working Group I
GERMANY

Asher MINNS
Tyndall Centre UEA and Future Earth Europe
UNITED KINGDOM

Paul MONARE
South African Broadcasting Corporation
SOUTH AFRICA

Stuart NEIL
World Energy Council
UNITED KINGDOM

Tim NUTHALL
European Climate Foundation
BELGIUM
Nick NUTTALL
United Nations Framework Convention on Climate Change (UNFCCC)
United Nations Framework Convention on Climate Change (UNFCCC)
James PAINTER
Reuters Institute for the Study of Journalism
UNITED KINGDOM

Jill PEETERS
VTM News
BELGIUM

Nina PEEVA
IPCC Secretariat

Roz PIDCOCK
Carbon Brief
UNITED KINGDOM

Hans Otto PÖRTNER
Co-Chair: IPCC Working Group II
University of Bremen
GERMANY

Debra ROBERTS
Co-Chair: IPCC Working Group II
EThekwinini Municipality
SOUTH AFRICA

Joyashree ROY
Jadavpur University
INDIA

Jim SKEA
Co-Chair: IPCC Working Group III
Imperial College London
UNITED KINGDOM

Youba SOKONA
IPCC Vice-Chair
The South Centre
SWITZERLAND

Per Espen STOKNES
Norwegian Business School
NORWAY

Kiyoto TANABE
Co-Chair: IPCC Task Force on National Greenhouse Gas Inventories
Institute for Global Environmental Strategies
JAPAN

Christianе TEXTOR
German IPCC Coordination Office
GERMANY

Melinda TIGNOR
Head: Technical Support Unit, IPCC Working Group II
GERMANY

Rabelani TSHIKALANKE
South Africa Department of Environmental Affairs
SOUTH AFRICA

Keith TUFLEY
The B Team
SWIZERLAND

Eliot WHITTINGTON
Cambridge Institute of Sustainability Leadership
UNITED KINGDOM

Michael WILLIAMS
World Meteorological Organisation

Mandy WOODS
WWF International Global Climate and Energy Initiative
SOUTH AFRICA

Xueyan YANG
Beijing Foreign Studies University
CHINA

Jean-Pascal van YPERSELE
Université catholique de Louvain
BELGIUM

Werani ZABULA
IPCC Secretariat

Simbisai ZHANJE
SouthSouthNorth
SOUTH AFRICA