



INTERGOVERNMENTAL PANEL ON **climate change**

FORTY-SEVENTH SESSION OF THE IPCC
Paris, France, 13 – 16 March 2018

IPCC-XLVII/INF. 5
(7.III.2018)
Agenda Item: 7
ENGLISH ONLY

**REPORT BY THE WORKING GROUP BUREAUX ON THE SELECTION OF COORDINATING
LEAD AUTHORS, LEAD AUTHORS, AND REVIEW EDITORS FOR THE SIXTH ASSESSMENT
REPORT**

**Report on the selection of Coordinating Lead Authors, Lead Authors, and Review Editors
of Working Group I Contribution to the Sixth Assessment Report**

(Submitted by the Co-Chairs of the IPCC Working Group I on behalf of the Bureau of Working Group I)

(Submitted by the Secretary of the IPCC)

NOTE:

This is an advance version without the list of selected Coordinating Lead Authors, Lead Authors, and Review Editors by Chapter. A revised version of this report including the list of authors will be posted when the list has been finalized and received.

IPCC Secretariat

c/o WMO • 7bis, Avenue de la Paix • C.P. 2300 • 1211 Geneva 2 • Switzerland

telephone : +41 (0) 22 730 8208 / 54 / 84 • fax : +41 (0) 22 730 8025 / 13 • email : IPCC-Sec@wmo.int • www.ipcc.ch

REPORT BY THE WORKING GROUP BUREAUX ON THE SELECTION OF COORDINATING LEAD AUTHORS, LEAD AUTHORS, AND REVIEW EDITORS FOR THE SIXTH ASSESSMENT REPORT

Report on the selection of Coordinating Lead Authors, Lead Authors, and Review Editors of Working Group I Contribution to the Sixth Assessment Report

1. The Working Group I AR6 Selection Process

The Working Group I (WGI) Bureau met in Geneva, Switzerland, from January 29-30, 2017, to finalize its selection of authors and review editors for the WGI contribution to the IPCC Sixth Assessment Report (AR6). This was the culmination of a comprehensive and considered process that included a careful evaluation of all the nominated experts, working through the following process (the schedule is provided in Annex I).

- All 996 nominations received were checked for their correct assignment and completeness (nomination form, CV). Where necessary, Focal Points were contacted by email, fax or phone to supply the missing information; this resulted in 911 complete nominations to be considered for WGI;
- The nomination pool of nominations had the following characteristics:
 - 189 candidates who applied for a role in WGI also applied for WGII and 84 for WGIII;
 - 17 candidates had previously been selected as Lead Author (LA), Coordinating Lead Author (CLA) or Review Editor (RE) in SROCC, 5 in SRCCL and 19 in SR1.5;
 - Citizens coming from developing countries represent 40% of applications;
 - Regions Europe and North America / Central America / Carib together account for over 50% of applications;
 - Women represent 25% of applications;
 - 83 citizenships are represented;
 - 76% of the applicants do not indicate any previous IPCC experience as LA, CLA or RE.

Selection Process

Step 1: Initial Rankings

Each Bureau Member was asked to identify priority nominations: a maximum of 5 nominees for each chapter and a maximum of 3 for the regional atlas identifying:

1. which indicative chapter bullet point(s) the nominee may address;
2. which WGI cross-cutting area(s) of expertise the nominee brings;
3. nominees that are relevant for the WGI regional atlas and for cross-WGII linkages;
4. nominees that are relevant for cross-WGIII linkages;
5. for which role the selected nominees are recommended (CLA, LA, RE).

Concise supporting information was sought on the selected candidates (e.g. cutting-edge expertise evidenced from relevant publications; broad overview of a research area evidenced from relevant review publications or assessments; demonstrated coordination skills; communication skills).

All criteria as stated in Appendix A of Principles Governing IPCC Work were considered:

"In selecting authors and review editors, consideration should be given to the following criteria: scientific, technical and socio-economic expertise, including the range of views; geographical representation; a mixture of experts with and without previous experience in IPCC; gender balance; experts with a background from relevant stakeholder and user groups, including governments."

If gaps were identified in the list of nominations, Bureau Members could consider submitting additional nominations.

Step 1: TSU Analysis

During Step 1 the TSU undertook a systematic analysis of each nominee addressing areas of expertise, recent publications (peer-reviewed, grey literature / reports) and measures of research impact (h-index, i10-index, Research Gate score).

Step 2: Preliminary List

A Preliminary List of chapter composition based on the Bureau Members' selection was compiled, highlighting overlaps and gaps, including any additional nominations that have been proposed. A suite of statistics and information (area of expertise, developed/developing, region, intra-regional information, gender, past IPCC experience) was prepared for the Preliminary List.

The Preliminary List was scrutinized for a cross-WGI chapter view of areas of expertise to ensure a critical number of experts able to implement cross-chapter coordination. Linkages with WGII and WGIII were also evaluated (see Annex 2).

Those not in the Preliminary List were not dropped and the Full List was provided (in a separate color at the bottom of each chapter sheet) so as to ensure full consideration and ease substitutions as needed to achieve balance across expertise, geographical and gender balance, participants with and without prior IPCC experience, etc.

Step 3: Core List

The Preliminary List was discussed by the WGI Co-Chairs and a proposal for a Core List for each chapter was made. The selection considered all the selection criteria, addressing overlaps, gaps (in expertise, geographic representation, gender, etc.). Co-Chairs provided suggestions on options to resolve any gaps (e.g. including additional Bureau nominations). Suggestions were made on the roles of nominees, particularly the CLA teams for each chapter.

Recommendations by the Co-Chairs were accompanied by concise comments explaining the selection, and a summary for each chapter describing the motivation for the proposed formation and compromises that have been made. The WGI TSU provided an updated suite of statistics and relevant information.

Step 4: Refinements to Core List

The Bureau made recommendations on the Core List, if necessary, to address any outstanding overlaps, gaps, imbalance. Any addition to or removal from the chapter formation was, where possible, accompanied by a suggested removal or replacement, clear motivation text, and taking care to maintain the overall balance of the selection.

Step 5: Proposal for Final List

Final adjustments were suggested by the Co-Chairs, based on the input received from the Bureau Members. The proposal for the Final List was circulated to the WGI Bureau for review, accompanied by updated statistics and information and a WGI Bureau call was held to discuss the selection and suggestions to improve the coverage of expertise and balance.

The WGI TSU provided an update on the status of the selection.

Step 6: Final List

The proposal for the Final List was discussed for coverage of expertise within each chapter and final adjustments were implemented. The Final List was approved by consensus by all members of the WGI Bureau in person during the WGI Bureau meeting held in Geneva on 29-30 January 2018.

2. Summary of Size, Distribution, and Balance

The AR6 WGI report consists of 12 chapters and an Atlas on information for the Regions. The first segment of the report (Chapters 1-4) is focused on the current state of the climate system, the understanding of human influence on observed changes, and future projections. The second segment (Chapters 5-9) is focused on global climate processes shaping global and regional climate, including the global biogeochemical cycles and short-lived climate forcers, energy and water cycles, and sea level. The final segment (Chapters 10-12) draws on the global climate system response to assess climate information at regional scales and regional climate change, including extremes in a changing climate and the assessment of regional climate information required for impacts and risk assessment. The WGI AR6 report will also encompass an Atlas for which a dedicated team has also been selected.

The WGI AR6 has been scoped to build on the assessment undertaken in the three AR6 Special Reports and to enhance links to WGII and WGIII. The selection considered carefully the links across all products of the AR6.

The selection agreed to by the WGI Bureau during its meeting on January 29-30 2018 was presented to the IPCC Bureau at its 55th Session (Geneva, Switzerland, 31 January 2018). The IPCC Bureau took note of the selection agreed by the WGI Bureau.

A comparison between authors selected for AR5 and AR6, both the nomination pool and the selected slate of authors, is provided in Table 1.

Table 1: Summary Overview of Numbers and Percentages of Author Nominations and Selection and Comparison to AR5

	AR6 Nominations		AR6 Selection		AR5 Selection	
Total	911	100%	232	25%	255	26%
DC/EIT	362	40%	98	42%	60	23%
Female	227	25%	63	27%	47	18%
New	689	76%	142	61%	167	65%

3. Treatment of Linkages to Other Working Groups

Many experts have been nominated for roles in more than one WG (189 candidates who applied for a role in WGI also applied for WGII and 84 for WGIII). This has presented an opportunity as well as a challenge in selecting the author slates in parallel. Discussions have been held among the Co-Chairs and TSUs of the WGs to ensure that these individuals are used to their best capacity and where possible can provide a contribution that links across WGs. WGII and WGIII authors, authors from the special reports but also authors not selected from the nomination pool, may be invited to participate as Contributing Authors where relevant to contribute targeted expertise to the WGI report.

4. Treatment of Cross Cutting Methodologies and Themes

Two major areas that require coordination across WGI and II are regional information in the assessment of climate mechanisms and linking climate variability and change and related uncertainties to the risk assessment framework. Chapter 12 of the WGI report explicitly includes the assessment of changes in hazards to facilitate integration with the other dimensions needed for risk assessment in WGII. The WGI report will also include an Atlas on information for the Regions. Similarly, the WGII outline identifies the integration of WGI information in its sectoral and regional chapters.

Nominations have been scrutinized to identify profiles that can bridge with the assessment undertaken by WGII (see Annex 2) and have been selected for Chapter 12 and the Atlas, as well as to contribute to the framing of the WGI report in Chapter 1. Authors with WGI expertise were selected for each of the WGII AR6 regional chapters by WGII; they are intended to provide a link to WGI, in particular for the regional Atlas.

The WGI Expert Meeting on Assessing Climate Information for Regions will be held in Trieste, Italy on 18-19 May 2018 and is expected to address the implementation of the 'handshake' between WGI and WGII and support the cross-WG treatment of regional issues. It is envisaged that WGII authors that link to the WGI regional assessment will attend the Expert Meeting along with relevant WGI authors and additional invited experts. WGII will help ensure an update of this knowledge through a one-day meeting to be held immediately prior to the start of the WGII AR6 Second Lead Author Meeting. This meeting will include relevant WGI authors that bridge across to WGII.

A coordination mechanism will be established for the development of the Atlas, such as the establishment of a cross-WG team of relevant WGI-WGII authors. WGI will provide drafts of the Atlas to WGII authors to review at each stage of preparation.

WGI-WGIII cross-cutting topics include the assessment of carbon budgets compatible with climate targets, climate metrics, land surface aspects (including land management and climate feedbacks), climate and air quality effects of short lived climate forcings and their mitigation potential, and greenhouse gas removal and solar radiation management. Authors were sought with profiles that can bridge across WGI-WGIII on relevant topics (see Annex II). Links to WGIII were considered in the selection of authors for Chapters 1, 4, 5, 6 and 7, in particular.

Climate change scenarios is a key overarching topic that will require an enhanced integrated approach to ensure a consistent and complete assessment in the AR6. A coordination mechanism is envisaged for the cross-WG treatment of scenarios, building on the lessons learned in the Special Report on global warming of 1.5°C where a cross-chapter task force for the coordination of the assessment of scenarios has been established by authors of the special report. This has so far proved to be an effective and fruitful mechanism for enhancing and improving consistency of definitions and terminology across chapters. This mechanism could be considered to ensuring consistency and communication on topics that cut across different special reports and WG reports.